<u>Attachment No. 4</u> Approved by National Committee Council



National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

17200 West Bell Road No.1135 * Surprise, Ariz. 85374 Telephone (623) 214-2403 * e-mail: ncutcd@aol.com

The Signals Technical Committee distributed a technical committee recommendation to sponsors concerning pedestrian hybrid beacons following the January 2011 meeting. Sponsor comments were reviewed and discussed at the June 2011 meeting. Based on the sponsor comments, minor wording changes were made by the STC and presented to the National Committee Council at the June 23, 2011 meeting. The recommended changes to the MUTCD, as modified by the STC at the June meeting, were approved by the National Committee Council.

The recommended changes to the text of Section 4F.02 approved by the National Committee Council are shown below with existing MUTCD text to be deleted shown in red strikethrough and new text to be added shown in <u>underline blue</u>.)

Section 4F.02 Design of Pedestrian Hybrid Beacons

Standard:

- 01 Except as otherwise provided in this Section, a pedestrian hybrid beacon shall meet the provisions of Chapters 4D and 4E.
- O2 A pedestrian hybrid beacon face shall consist of three signal sections, with a CIRCULAR YELLOW signal indication centered below two horizontally aligned CIRCULAR RED signal indications (see Figure 4F-3).
- 03 When an engineering study finds that installation of a pedestrian hybrid beacon is justified, then:
 - A. At least two pedestrian hybrid beacon faces shall be installed for each approach of the major street,
 - B. A stop line shall be installed for each approach to the crosswalk,
 - C. A pedestrian signal head conforming to the provisions set forth in Chapter 4E shall be installed at each end of the marked crosswalk, and
 - D. The pedestrian hybrid beacon shall be pedestrian actuated.
 - **E.** If a pedestrian hybrid beacon is installed at or immediately adjacent to an intersection with a side road, vehicular traffic on the side road shall be controlled by STOP signs.

Guidance:

- 04 When an engineering study finds that installation of a pedestrian hybrid beacon is justified, then: <u>A. The pedestrian hybrid beacon should be installed at least 100 feet from side streets or driveways that are controlled by STOP or YIELD signs</u>,
 - *AB.* Parking and other sight obstructions should be prohibited for at least 100 feet in advance of and at least 20 feet beyond the marked crosswalk, or site accommodations should be made through curb extensions or other techniques to provide adequate sight distance,
 - BC. The installation should include suitable standard signs and pavement markings, and
 - *C*D*. If installed within a signal system, the pedestrian hybrid beacon should be coordinated.*
- On approaches having posted or statutory speed limits or 85th-percentile speeds in excess of 35 mph and on approaches having traffic or operating conditions that would tend to obscure visibility of roadside hybrid beacon face locations, both of the minimum of two pedestrian hybrid beacon faces should be installed over the roadway.

- On multi-lane approaches having a posted or statutory speed limits or 85th-percentile speeds of 35 mph or less, either a pedestrian hybrid beacon face should be installed on each side of the approach (if a median of sufficient width exists) or at least one of the pedestrian hybrid beacon faces should be installed over the roadway.
- 07 *A pedestrian hybrid beacon should comply with the signal face location provisions described in Sections* 4D.11 through 4D.16.
 - Standard:
- O8 A CROSSWALK STOP ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-23) sign (see Section 2B.53) shall be mounted adjacent to a pedestrian hybrid beacon face on each major street approach. If an overhead pedestrian hybrid beacon face is provided, the sign shall be mounted adjacent to the overhead signal face.

Option:

A Pedestrian (W11-2) warning sign (see Section 2C.50) with an AHEAD (W16-9P) supplemental plaque may be placed in advance of a pedestrian hybrid beacon. A warning beacon may be installed to supplement the W11-2 sign.

Guidance:

- 10 If a warning beacon supplements a W11-2 sign in advance of a pedestrian hybrid beacon, it should be programmed to flash only when the pedestrian hybrid beacon is not in the dark mode. **Standard:**
- 11 If a warning beacon is installed to supplement the W11-2 sign, the design and location of the warning beacon shall comply with the provisions of Sections 4L.01 and 4L.03.

For reference, the item as distributed to sponsors and including the reason for proposed changes is on the following pages. The changes made by the STC at the June meeting were the deletion of "or driveway" in two places in proposed new item E in paragraph 03 as shown:

E. If a pedestrian hybrid beacon is installed at or immediately adjacent to an intersection with a side road-or-driveway, vehicular traffic on the side road-or-driveway shall be controlled by STOP signs.

Signals #1



National Committee on Uniform Traffic Control Devices

17200 West Bell Road No.1135 * Surprise, Ariz. 85374 Telephone (623) 214-2403 * e-mail: ncutcd@aol.com

2		
3		Signals Technical Committee
4 5	TOPIC:	Pedestrian Hybrid Beacon (HAWK)
6 7 8	STATUS/DATE OF ACTION:	Send for Sponsor Comments
9 10 11	Signals Approval: Transmitted to Sponsors: Council Approval:	2011 (and previously 2007) 2011
12 13 14	ORIGIN OF REQUEST:	STC, January 2011 Meeting
14 15 16	AFFECTED SECTIONS OF MUTCD:	4F.02

17 SUMMARY:

18

The Signals Technical Committee previously recommended that a pedestrian hybrid beacon be added to Part 4 of the MUTCD. This was submitted to sponsors for comments, approved by the National Committee Council, and forwarded to FHWA as a National Committee recommendation. This recommendation did not include any restrictions, either as a standard or as guidance, on where such devices could or should be installed on a roadway.

25

The Notice of Proposed Amendment (NPA) for the 2009 MUTCD included the pedestrian hybrid beacon (although the name was changed to pedestrian hybrid signal) using basically the language as submitted by the National Committee. When the Final Rule was issued, the name was again pedestrian hybrid beacon but the language included new guidance that *"the pedestrian hybrid beacon should be installed at least 100 feet from side streets or driveways that are controlled by STOP or YIELD signs".* It indicated that this modification was made based on comments to the docket.

33

Although the National Committee and public had an opportunity to comment on the published NPA, there was no opportunity to comment on this significant change to the language included in the MUTCD Final Rule. The language included in the MUTCD is inconsistent with the experimentation that was performed for the use of this traffic control device and with the application as approved and recommended by the National Committee. The STC recommends a return to the language for pedestrian hybrid

2

beacons that was included in the NPA that permits installation at intersections or
 driveways where the side road or driveway traffic is controlled by STOP signs.

42

43 **DISCUSSION**

44

The proposed addition of the pedestrian hybrid beacon was approved in 2007 by the 45 STC and National Committee and forwarded to FHWA. At the January 2011 meeting, 46 the STC discussed what was included in the MUTCD Final Rule versus what the 47 National Committee had recommended and what was included in the NPA. The STC 48 voted to recommend a return to the design and application of these beacons as listed in 49 the NPA thus removing the guidance statement against installation within 100 feet of an 50 intersection or driveway. This proposed change is being sent for sponsor review and 51 comment. 52

53

The SC feels that the addition of guidance language that these beacons should be at least 100 feet from a side street or driveway (Section 4F.02) is a significant change from what was reviewed and approved by the National Committee and from what was proposed in the NPA. Following are several concerns about the final MUTCD language:

- The result of the added guidance, if followed, is that these beacons could not be
 used at intersections or driveways. The NPA language did not include any
 limitations (either standard or guidance) on the locations for use. This change
 was not subject to public review and comment.
- The 100 foot offset listed in the guidance is not supported by research or experimentation with this device.
- Most sites used for experimentation when the pedestrian hybrid beacon was
 being tested were intersection or driveway locations. Therefore, the typical use
 of the device as tested, which ultimately proved to be successful, is
 recommended against in the 2009 MUTCD.
- A FHWA publication, Safety Effectiveness of the HAWK Pedestrian Crossing 69 Treatment (http://www.fhwa.dot.gov/publications/research/safety/10042/10042.pdf) 70 includes the results of an evaluation of the effectiveness of these devices at 71 several locations. The conclusion indicates that intersections with pedestrian 72 hybrid beacons experienced a 29% reduction in all vehicular crashes and a 69% 73 reduction in pedestrian crashes. The study notes that "all 21 HAWKs included in 74 this safety study were located either at a minor intersection (where the minor 75 76 street was controlled by a STOP sign) or at a major driveway (where the driveway was controlled by a STOP sign)." The study was performed before the 77 publication of the 2009 MUTCD and notes that the 2009 MUTCD includes a 78 guidance statement recommending installation at least 100 feet from 79 80 intersections or driveways.
- The guidance, if followed, causes increased mobility difficulties and discomfort for pedestrians with disabilities and forces all pedestrians to experience

increased inconvenience if they must divert away from their desired crossing 83 location at an intersection or driveway to a different crossing point. 84

The STC feels that the use of pedestrian hybrid beacons at intersections or driveways 85 has been adequately evaluated and operational problems associated with being 86 installed at such locations have not been experienced. Therefore, the STC 87 recommends that the National Committee recommend to FHWA that the guidance for 88 installing a pedestrian hybrid beacon at least 100 feet from an intersection or driveway 89 be deleted and that related text regarding installation at an intersection or driveway be 90 added. 91

92

93 RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO THE MUTCD (Section 4F.02)

- 94 Note: Existing MUTCD text to be deleted is shown in red strikethrough. New text 95 to be added is shown in underline blue. 96
- 97 98

108

109

110

111

112 113

116 117

118

119

120

121

122

Section 4F.02 Design of Pedestrian Hybrid Beacons

- 99 Standard:
- 100 Except as otherwise provided in this Section, a pedestrian hybrid beacon shall meet the provisions of 01 101 Chapters 4D and 4E.
- 102 A pedestrian hybrid beacon face shall consist of three signal sections, with a CIRCULAR YELLOW 02 103 signal indication centered below two horizontally aligned CIRCULAR RED signal indications (see 104 Figure 4F-3).

105 When an engineering study finds that installation of a pedestrian hybrid beacon is justified, then: 03 106 A. At least two pedestrian hybrid beacon faces shall be installed for each approach of the major street, 107

- B. A stop line shall be installed for each approach to the crosswalk,
- C. A pedestrian signal head conforming to the provisions set forth in Chapter 4E shall be installed at each end of the marked crosswalk, and
- D. The pedestrian hybrid beacon shall be pedestrian actuated.
- E. If a pedestrian hybrid beacon is installed at or immediately adjacent to an intersection with a side road or driveway, vehicular traffic on the side road or driveway shall be controlled by STOP signs.

114 *Guidance*:

- 115 When an engineering study finds that installation of a pedestrian hybrid beacon is justified, then: 04
 - A. The pedestrian hybrid beacon should be installed at least 100 feet from side streets or driveways that are controlled by STOP or YIELD signs,
 - AB. Parking and other sight obstructions should be prohibited for at least 100 feet in advance of and at least 20 feet beyond the marked crosswalk, or site accommodations should be made through curb extensions or other techniques to provide adequate sight distance,
 - BC. The installation should include suitable standard signs and pavement markings, and
 - CD. If installed within a signal system, the pedestrian hybrid beacon should be coordinated.
- 123 On approaches having posted or statutory speed limits or 85th-percentile speeds in excess of 35 mph and on 05 124 approaches having traffic or operating conditions that would tend to obscure visibility of roadside hybrid beacon face locations, both of the minimum of two pedestrian hybrid beacon faces should be installed over the roadway. 125
- On multi-lane approaches having a posted or statutory speed limits or 85th-percentile speeds of 35 mph or 126 06 less, either a pedestrian hybrid beacon face should be installed on each side of the approach (if a median of 127 128 sufficient width exists) or at least one of the pedestrian hybrid beacon faces should be installed over the 129 roadway.
- 130 07 A pedestrian hybrid beacon should comply with the signal face location provisions described in Sections 131 4D.11 through 4D.16.

132 Standard:

133	08		OSSWALK STOP ON RED (symbolic circular red) (R10-23) sign (see Section 2B.53) shall be	
134			adjacent to a pedestrian hybrid beacon face on each major street approach. If an overhead	
135		pedestria	In hybrid beacon face is provided, the sign shall be mounted adjacent to the overhead signal	
136		face.		
137		Option:		
138	09	A Ped	estrian (W11-2) warning sign (see Section 2C.50) with an AHEAD (W16-9P) supplemental plaque	
139		may be p	laced in advance of a pedestrian hybrid beacon. A warning beacon may be installed to supplement	
140		the W11-	2 sign.	
141		Guidanc	е:	
142	10	If a wa	rning beacon supplements a W11-2 sign in advance of a pedestrian hybrid beacon, it should be	
143		programmed to flash only when the pedestrian hybrid beacon is not in the dark mode.		
144		Standar	d:	
145	11	If a warning beacon is installed to supplement the W11-2 sign, the design and location of the warning		
146		beacon shall comply with the provisions of Sections 4L.01 and 4L.03.		
147				
148				
149				
150	V	OTE:	Unanimous "FOR" with 1 abstention	